

**Citation:** Önez Çetin, Z. (2020), The Total Quality Management Implementation at Municipal Administrations: A Research On Strategic Plans of Aegean Region Provinces' Municipal Administration In Turkey, BMIJ, (2020), 8(1): 924-949 doi: <http://dx.doi.org/10.15295/bmij.v8i1.1351>

**THE TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT IMPLEMENTATION AT  
MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATIONS: A RESEARCH ON STRATEGIC  
PLANS OF AEGEAN REGION PROVINCES' MUNICIPAL  
ADMINISTRATIONS IN TURKEY**

Zuhal ÖNEZ ÇETİN<sup>1</sup>

Received Date (Başvuru Tarihi): 02/12/2019

Accepted Date (Kabul Tarihi): 19/01/2020

Published Date (Yayın Tarihi): 25/03/2020

**ABSTRACT**

*Total Quality Management (TQM) launched to be used at local government structure by the 1990s onwards in Turkey. Local governments, especially the municipalities, have been facing with numerous problems at service provision in Turkey. TQM is generally mentioned as an approach that is generating positive results for municipal administrations such as strengthening the municipalities in respect of effectiveness and efficiency, improving the quality of the local services, and facilitating municipalities in maintaining their power. The first objective of the study is to search the emergence of TQM for municipalities in Turkey with the examination of key projects and five-year development plans. In the second step, the TQM significance for local governments has been searched and the key benefits of TQM on municipal administrations in Turkey have been defined. Thirdly, strategic plans of Aegean Region provinces' municipal administrations in Turkey have been evaluated in terms of TQM reflection to their strategic planning processes.*

**Keywords:** Total Quality Management, Local Government, Municipal Administration, Turkey

**Jel Codes:** H1, H7

**TOPLAM KALİTE YÖNETİMİNİN BELEDİYE YÖNETİMLERİNDE  
UYGULANMASI: TÜRKİYE'DE EGE BÖLGESİ İLLERİ BELEDİYE  
YÖNETİMLERİNİN STRATEJİK PLANLARI ÜZERİNE BİR ARAŞTIRMA**

**ÖZ**

*Toplam Kalite Yönetimi (TKY) Türkiye'de 1990'lı yıllardan itibaren yerel yönetim yapısında kullanılmaya başlandı. Yerel yönetimler, özellikle belediyeler, Türkiye'de hizmet sunumunda birçok sorunla karşı karşıyadır. TKY genel olarak, belediyeleri etkililik ve verimlilik açısından güçlendirmek, yerel hizmetlerin kalitesini iyileştirmek ve belediyelerin güçlerini korumalarını kolaylaştırmak gibi belediye idareleri için olumlu sonuçlar üreten bir yaklaşım olarak belirtilmektedir. Çalışmanın ilk amacı, temel projelerin ve beş yıllık kalkınma planlarının incelenmesi ile TKY' nin Türkiye'deki belediyeler için ortaya çıkışını araştırmaktır. İkinci adımda, yerel yönetimler için TKY' nin önemi araştırılmış ve TKY' nin Türkiye'deki belediye yönetimleri üzerindeki temel faydaları belirtilmiştir. Üçüncü olarak, Türkiye' deki Ege Bölgesi illeri belediye yönetimlerinin stratejik planları, TKY' nin stratejik planlama süreçlerine yansımaları açısından değerlendirilmiştir.*

**Anahtar Kelimeler:** Toplam Kalite Yönetimi, Yerel Yönetim, Belediye Yönetimi, Türkiye

**Jel Kodları:** H1, H7

<sup>1</sup> Dr. Öğr. Üyesi, Uşak Üniversitesi, İİBF, Kamu Yönetimi Bl., Yerel Yönetimler ABD Başkanı, [zuhal.cetin@usak.edu.tr](mailto:zuhal.cetin@usak.edu.tr)  
<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-4241-1487>

## 1. INTRODUCTION

By the 1980s onwards, the globalization process leads to radical changes at the economic, social, political, cultural and technological context, at that point, the reasons that have an impact on the re-definition of the role of the state have been pointed out as new world order formed at the international politics, the transformation in the production techniques and the information age tied to the improvement of the telecommunication technologies (Özeroğlu, 2015: 540). In that framework, public administration is asserted as a significant complementary part of daily life liable from the offering of public services, in this sense, the expectations of the society generally increase with the rise of the socio-economic level concerning the rendering of public services, and the citizen, who is the client of the state is questioning the problems at public administration such as ineffectiveness and inefficiency issues (Balcı, 2005: 1). Moreover, the concerns about public services related to the quality of the public services and especially the financial burden issue of public services lead to the questioning of public administration and also the approach pertinent to the public service (Mengi, 1997: 505). In that changing environment, the public sector confronted with problems in related to the provision of public services and the need for reform in the provision of effective and efficient service came to the forefront; Total Quality Management (TQM), has started to be implemented in the public sector and that approach focuses on efficiency and quality concepts at public services (Leblebici, Gönülşen and Aydın, 2001: 123). There is also the initiative of the implementation of some modern enterprise management techniques in the public administrations with considering the private sector as a sample with the targets of the provision of qualified public services and also the provision of those services with low-cost (Mengi, 1997: 505). TQM practices have been implemented within the public administration with those listed reasons such as the cumbersome structure and inefficiency of public institutions, the complexity of authority and responsibility (Özeroğlu, 2015: 540).

At that point, the municipal administrations in Turkey launched to change their provision of public services. The main motives for quality and efficiency studies in municipalities have been listed by those themes; the development of the city and the necessities of the city, the responsibility towards the citizen, the resource usage, the diversification of service demands and the rise of the awareness of local citizens, the coordination between public institutions (Kaya, 2012: 8-9). At that point, Peker (1996a: 16) clarified TQM with those words “nowadays, TQM is also seen as an administrative approach that strengthening the

municipalities, making them more autonomous, accelerating the localization efforts, increasing the effectiveness and ensuring the re-election of the elected people”.

## **2. THE EMERGENCE OF TQM IN TURKEY**

In that regard, the context of quality has been varied in years, the priority was on quality in production in the 1960s, on the cost in the 1970s, on the product quality in the 1980s, to produce fast in the 1990s and nowadays, the context quality is used with the concept of the provision of good service (Soysal and Alici, 2006: 169). Moreover, Peker (1996b: 44) pointed out that “the concept of total quality, which was successful with its structural and systemic features in the 1950s when it emerged, renewed itself under changing conditions and strengthened some of its managerial qualities towards human-being. As a result, Total Quality Management, which is built on a strong structure-system-technical trio and shaped by a philosophy that is human origin, has emerged”.

According to the appearance of that new understanding, Özşen (1998: 284) clarified that “Total Quality Management is introduced as an approach that has emerged, been implemented in private enterprises and is said to give successful results”. In local government dimension, the enhancement of the quality and productivity studies and efforts came forefront by the 1970s onwards in industrialized countries, whereas those studies towards the improvement of quality emerged in the 1990s in Turkey (Kaya, 2012: 8). Large-scale industrial enterprises management structure have been confronted with changes such as the application of modern management understanding that the concepts of quality and human resources launched to be used during the 1990s (Suğur *et.al.*, 2004: 131).

The starting point of TQM in Turkey was also declared as with the launch of the implementation of quality control circle in Turkey; Şişe Cam, Efes Pilsen, and Migros have been the pioneers in those activities, and the implementation of ISO 9000 system standard in Turkey is also evaluated as a support towards TQM after the year 1989 (Yatkın, 2004: 90-91). Moreover, TQM process has also been affected by the emergence of various organizations related to quality at national and international level, and those institutions have also the initiative of the provision of various quality awards, at that point, leading firms in Turkey faced with a competition in order to get awards at the national level (Kal-Der awards) and at the international level (European Quality Association awards) (Suğur *et. al.*, 2004: 132). In Turkey, the studies towards the quality and efficiency have been launched during the 1990s, however, there were also initiatives listed as the reduction the bureaucracy in the

central and local governments, re-organization of the administrative services, re-structuring the administration, and administrative reform in the 1960s in Turkey (Kaya, 2012: 8).

With the 6/209 numbered decision of Council of Ministers on 13/02/1962, it was decided to conduct a research and Project Board of Director selection to manage the research by the Prime Minister with the cooperation of TODAIE, SPO, State Personnel Department, the relevant faculties, ministries and departments to search the distribution of style of central government responsibilities among the ministries, departments and institutions including to Turkey's Central Government Organization and to examine whether this distribution allows public services to be carried out in the most efficient manner and to make proposals and recommendations on this issue (Arik and Sürgit, 1964: 92 cited in Coşkun, 2005: 19 ). Moreover, in the planned period, 'Central Government Organization Research Project' (MEHTAP) evaluated as the most important initiative aimed at the re-organization of local governments, as a consequence of that related research one of the proposal is determined as to examine the local governments and local governments relation with central government (Keleş, 2012: 444). The Interior Order Project was started in 1967 and finalized in 1971 by the Ministry of Interior, and the aim of the project is determined as to search the distribution of the aims, duties, and authorities, responsible personnel, organizational structures and the functioning of the organization of the central and provincial levels of all organizations included in the Ministry of Interior, the organizations tied to the Ministry or the organizations under the supervision of the Ministry and the local governments to re-organize the internal service and organization of the Ministry of Interior (Keleş, 2012: 447). At that point, it is also determined that the Ministry of Interior has prepared 12 draft laws (such as provincial special administration, municipality, village, municipal penalties, local administrations institute, metropolitan service union, local government officials draft laws) from the data obtained in this study (Keleş, 2012: 447). Besides, Keleş (2012: 464) also clarified that "TODAIE launched the Public Administration Research Project (KAYA) project in 1989 upon the request of the State Planning Organization to investigate the what extent the previous studies that have been carried out reflect to the implementation process to develop and re-organize the public administration, to identify the deficiencies, the problems of the bottlenecks and to identify measures to be taken".

In the Eighth Five-Year Development Plan (2001-2005) under the heading of "quality control and standardization", under the sub-heading of the expected development in 2002, it is declared that "Technology Development Foundation of Turkey with KALDER

(TTGV) have a cooperation with the target that in line with their participation in the National Quality Movement that aims primarily Total Quality Management dissemination in our country, it is targeted to provide total quality management, excellence model training and guidance to the SME (*KOBİ*)s wishing to receive, to assist in the development of quality infrastructure and thus widening of the total quality management of Turkey's organizations operating in all sectors and to help SMEs in increasing their competitiveness power, improve their performance and develop their systems" (p.148). Moreover, at that related Development Plan, it is clarified that "At the national level, with the participation of public and private sector and non-governmental organizations, increasing productivity and improving quality will be the basis. For this purpose, training and awareness-raising activities will be expanded and the importance will be given on total quality management practices based on programming and coordination of activities in all kinds of goods and services production" (p.149).

In the Ninth Five-Year Development Plan (2007-2013), at the sub-title of 7.5. named "Improving Quality and Effectiveness in Public Services", at the item 686, there are also clarifications concerning to increase the quality of public services, and at the item 694, it is clarified that "in order to improve the management quality of public administrations, it is determined that all public administrations will prepare and implement their strategic plans at the plan period" (p.103).

In the Tenth Five-Year Development Plan (2014-2018), the term quality has also been used at those sub-items listed below;

"135. With the developments provided, the need continues for further improvement of the physical and human infrastructure and the improvement of quality and effectiveness in the provision of public services in order to strengthen the foundations of development (p.30).

144. In the education system, the quality-oriented transformation will be sustained based on equality of opportunity, which improves the personality and abilities of individuals, strengthens the harmony with the labor market within the framework of lifelong learning approach (p.31).

169. The need for improvement in protective and preventive health services, performance-based supplementary payment system, referral chain, and health manpower continues to provide better quality and cost-effective health services (p.34)".

In the eleventh Five-Year Development Plan (2019-2023); the term quality has also been used at those sub-items listed below;

“87. Although significant progress has been made in the field of education in Turkey, fundamental reforms in the education system and the improvement of the quality of education and the training of the necessary labor force for competitive production and productivity are among the main priorities in achieving the objectives envisaged in the Plan period (p.11).

152. Social policies implemented during the Plan period have been effective in improving the participation of all segments of society in economic and social life and strengthening vulnerable segments of the population. As a result of the developments in the labor market, there has been a significant increase in employment. On the other hand, labor force participation was higher than this increase, resulting in an increase in the unemployment rate. The need to strengthen the physical and human infrastructure in the labor market and to improve the quality of service provision remains important (p.23).

174. The possibility to include the segments outside the labor force participation to the labor force will be provided in the working-age population. The workforce competencies and its compliance with the business life will be realized with better quality education and generalized professional and focused training opportunities, (p.27).”

### **3. TOTAL QUALITY MANAGEMENT AND LOCAL GOVERNMENTS**

The distinguishing feature of TQM is designated with its five principles of leadership, the customer and employee focus, the focus on the facts, the continuous development (KAIZEN) and the participation of all parts (Dahlgaard, Kristensen and Kanji, 2007:17). At that context, Yatkin (2004: 20) refers TQM as “all efforts to improve the quality of goods and services in a narrow sense and broadly refers to all efforts to be made in the organization to continuously improve the quality of the organization or institution”. TQM is depending on three principles such as focusing on customers and stakeholders, participation of everyone and teamwork in the organization, continuous improvement and a process focus supported by learning (Ersoy and Ersoy, 2011: 26). Arikboğa (2016: 26) clarified that “the main elements of total quality management can be listed as follows: leadership, customer focus, continuous improvement, employee participation and teamwork, employee training and development, data-based management and preventive approach”. The key components of TQM have also been expressed as leadership, the management of people, focus on



customers, the utilization of information and analysis, the improvement of process and strategic and quality planning (Samson and Terziovski, 1999: 393-394).

At that framework, local administrations are liable from varied services and the critical role of local administrations also include the issues of how and to what extent the services are fulfilled by local administrations, and the concept of quality is also associated with the response of how the local services should be that are provided by local administrations (Öztürk and Coşkun, 1998: 115). The municipalities' critical role has been determined with those listed peculiarities such as; their meeting of the common and local based public necessities in the daily lives of the local citizens, and having an institutional structure paving the way for the development of democratic values, and lastly as well as being the closest public administration institutions to the local citizens; in that regard, the local citizens expected local services provision from the municipalities with considering the key themes of efficiency, effectiveness, and quality (Nohutçu, 2005: 92).

The factors that lead to TQM implementation in municipalities are listed as follows; the development of technology and communication, the innovations to be brought by TQM to local governments, the need for restructuring of municipalities, the efficiency and effectiveness problem in local governments, the diversification and increase of the expectations of the people, the importance of TQM for local governments (Özgül, 2014: 63). In this sense, Öztürk and Coşkun (1998: 116) determined that “in case TQM is implemented in local governments (municipalities), local administrations will have a better functioning administrative structure. The efficiency of local government employees will increase and their commitment to the organization and the management will be strengthened. Besides, the services provided to citizens will become better quality”. In this context, the necessity of TQM has been determined as follows; the fact that some of the activities carried out by the public institutions have not been fulfilled at the desired level due to the change in the public service concept, not to provide sufficient resources to public service investments and not to produce services at the desired quality, inconsistencies in personnel policy in some services due to improper employment policies, the limited resource allocation to public services etc.. (Yatkın, 2004: 103).

At that framework, the points that the municipalities should give importance at the transition to the TQM system are declared as follows (Öztemel, 2001: 69-70 cited in Nohutçu, 2005: 96-97): “to prepare the institution psychologically and taking the support of the senior (top) management, to establish a total quality implementation and execution

board, to develop an institutional meeting system, to develop an institution specific communication and data collection system, to establish an institution specific education system, to improve the proposals and complaints system, to establish a quality assurance system, to arrange TQM informing activities, to form the municipal strategic plan, to measure customer and employee satisfaction and ensuring social participation, to organize extended information meetings, to conduct process analysis and to start continuous improvement studies, to set up a performance evaluation system to continuously measure the performance of processes, to conduct service analyzes and establish service management system, to establish cost and resource management systems, to establish teamwork and problem-solving teams, to provide the usage of scientific methods at solving problems, to be able to make self-assessment, to make comparisons, to conduct conformity tests to business excellence models”.

In that scope, in case of TQM application to municipal administrations; the benefits to be gained were clarified as expected to go to an organization to mobilize and use social resources, responsible for all aspects of services, prioritizing community benefit, sensitive to the age and environment and integrated with its environment (Özeroğlu, 2015: 562-563). Local governments came into power with local elections in order to serve public services in a qualified manner, and especially municipal administrators and their decision-making organs have been elected by the public because of that reason, and an appropriate application of TQM has a critical impact for municipal administrations on the issue such as maintaining of their powers (Peker, 1996a: 16). At that scope, Öztürk and Coşkun (1998: 117) declared that “as local administrators are elected, it is important for them to meet the service expectations of citizen and as a result local citizen are satisfied with the local government”.

With the TQM, in the organizations and enterprises a change occurs at the organizational units such as the units based on the teamwork and the horizontal organization, having the mutual interactions and communication among each other will be ensured instead of the organizational units having the characteristics that based on the vertical hierarchical structure that are specialized in certain areas, separated from each other (Saran and Göçerler, 1998: 233). In this sense, Nohutçu (2005: 93) clarified that “in case of the adoption and implementation of TQM as a philosophy of life and style, managers, employees, and local citizens possess the city and municipal administration, will make efforts to ensure that processes are effective, efficient, rapid and economical, costs will be reduced, quality of services will increase...”.



Moreover, the problems encountered in the practice of TQM in the public sector are examined under two headings as general problems and specific problems in Turkey (Acar and Sevinç, 2013: 4). Public organizations can be faced with those listed general problems at the application of TQM; the disbelief on quality, the resistance to change, the excessive exaggeration of TQM, insufficient analysis of the current situation, having ordinary expectations, the attitudes of management and managers, not rewarding success, the inadequacy at education (Acar and Sevinç, 2013: 5) The specific problems are listed as the structure of public sector (public sector demonstrates more resistance to change, the evaluation of success, the using of initiative, political behavior, size, the effect of interest groups, uncertainty), the concept of customer, service-product dilemma, quality & quantity dichotomy (Acar and Sevinç, 2013: 10-14).

#### **4. A RESEARCH ON THE STRATEGIC PLANS OF AEGEAN REGION PROVINCES' MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATIONS: THE MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATIONS' EVALUATION OF QUALITY AND TQM**

In this study, in order to see the current situation of municipal administrations in Turkey in related to TQM, municipalities of Aegean Region provinces' (Izmir, Manisa, Denizli, Muğla, Aydın, Afyon, Uşak, Kütahya) municipal administrations (only the city municipal administrations are included to the study) have been examined through their published strategic plans to grasp the “total quality” process reflection to the strategic plans starting from 2010 to 2019. In this study, document analysis method has been used concerning the strategic plans of those related municipal administrations; the objective of the study is to search the usage of the concept of the quality at those documents to see in which areas the quality concept has gained importance at the Aegean provinces municipal administrations in Turkey. Document analysis has been made by the help of the NVIVO Pro-12 Program. The quality term's usage frequency and used areas at the strategic plan sentences have been analyzed and demonstrated at the study with the charts below that are prepared according to the results and findings gained from NVIVO Pro-12 Program.

In the Public Financial Management and Control Law No. 5018 (2003: 8660), at the item 3/n, the strategic plan identified as “a plan that includes the medium and long term objectives, basic principles and policies, objectives and priorities, performance measures of the public administrations, and methods to be followed and resource allocation to achieve them.” Moreover, Nohutçu (2005: 94) expressed that “at the Law No. 5018, the following provisions have been located that form the basis for TQM; Item (1) The purpose of this Law is to regulate

... the effective, economic and efficient obtaining and utilization of public resources, Item 5 (g) In providing the production of goods and services and meeting the needs of public administrations, it is essential to perform cost-benefit or cost-effectiveness and other economic and social analyzes deemed necessary in accordance with the principles of economic or social efficiency”.

Moreover, Özeroğlu (2015: 578-579) clarified that “while municipalities form their mission, vision and their own values as required by Law No. 5018, they choose accountability and transparency as the most foremost value and declare their customer-oriented service excellence almost to all relevant circles with opening themselves to the control of stakeholder elements”.

Within the context of the study, the strategic plans of those related municipal administrations have been determined for analysis with the motive that to see the concept of quality’s usage at their vision, mission, basic values and principles, strategic objectives and goals, and strategies. In that scope, the first target of the study is to search the term “quality” to find out that term’s usage frequency at strategic plans of the municipal administrations covering 2010-2019 periods. Secondly, the references in related with the term “quality” at the sentences of strategic plan documents of those related municipality administrations have been searched mainly at the categories of vision, mission, basic values and principles, strategic objectives, goals and strategies in order to analyze the municipal administrations’ view related to quality and to search the reflection of the TQM to the strategic plans of municipal administrations.

**Table 1.** Word Frequency Rates According to the Years of Strategic Plans

STRATEGIC PLANS	Word Frequency Rates According to the Years of Strategic Plans	
	2010-2014	2015-2019
AYDIN	3	6
DENİZLİ	3	11
İZMİR	10	4
KÜTAHYA	- <sup>2</sup>	1
MANİSA	-	4
MUĞLA	1	2
UŞAK	2	7
AFYON	3	5

<sup>2</sup> The strategic plans of Kütahya and Manisa covering the years of 2010-2014 have not been available at the web-sites of those related municipalities.

This chart demonstrates the use frequency of the term “quality” at the strategic plans of the Aegean Region provinces municipal administrations; those data have been grasped by Nvivo 12-pro program word frequency analysis. As it is seen from that chart, the term quality has been used at most 11 times at the strategic plans.

**Table 2.** The Influence of TQM Approach on the 2015-2019 Period Strategic Plans of Aegean Region’s Provinces Municipal Administrations:

STRATEGIC PLANS	2015-2019
AFYON	<p><b>7.2. Vision:</b> Providing <b>qualified municipal services</b> to our citizens in Afyon...(p.55)</p> <p><b>7.3. Principles:</b> Afyon Municipality shall adhere to the following principles while producing services;  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Participation,• Transparency,• Citizen satisfaction</li> <li>• Efficiency in resource utilization and <b>service quality</b>. (p.55)</li> </ul> <b>Employee satisfaction:</b> It is essential to support the professional and personal development of our employees. Our Municipality accepts to improve the services in terms of quality and quantity through more voluntary and active participation of its employees in municipal activities. Because the municipality believes that the municipal administration, its employees and suppliers should make joint efforts to provide the highest quality service to the citizen. ( p.56)</p> <p><b>Efficiency in resource utilization and quality in service:</b> Providing the highest quality service to the citizens by using municipal resources in the most efficient way.</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 1:</b> Strengthening the institutional structure, transition to e-municipality: ... <b>developing qualified and effective personnel policies</b> to set up a coordinated internal structure. (p.57)</p> <p><b>Goal 2 (SO3G2: urban planning aesthetics and urban control):</b> Ensuring a clean environment and a livable urban environment. <b>Strategy 2 (SO3G2S2):</b> In order to increase <b>the quality level of pesticide works</b> to provide in-service training to related personnel.(p.74)</p> <p><b>Goal 14 (SO4G14: social and cultural city):</b> Establishment of Art Street</p> <p><b>Performance Indicators:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Realizing the ‘Art Street’ project with the target of developing <b>the quality of life</b> of the inhabitants in a healthy and artistic urban environment while preserving the urban identity within the historical fabric.(p.89)</li> </ol> <p><b>Goal 22(SO4G22): Providing qualified service</b> and maximizing customer satisfaction. (p.91)</p>
DENİZLİ	<p><b>Our Principles and Basic Values:</b> sensitive to the human and environment, We support the professional and social development of our employees, Participatory, pluralistic management is indispensable, We base our relations with our internal and external stakeholders on the basis of good governance, We are always with you with our <b>qualified</b> and citizen-oriented service.(p.8)</p> <p><b>Strengths:</b> Our managers and our personnel have adopted <b>the principle of quality</b> and fast service to the citizens as a basic principle, and municipal administration has a working understanding aiming <b>to increase the quality of urban life</b>, and municipal administration has <b>Quality Management Systems certificates</b>. (p.37)</p>

	<p><b>Strategic Objective 1-</b> Ensuring continuity in the development of institutional capacity in order to reach the vision of Denizli Metropolitan Municipality. (p.57)  <b>Strategy:</b> The needs of the personnel regarding the physical working environment shall be provided on time, in the desired quantity and <b>quality</b>. (p.59)  <b>Strategic Objective 2-</b> Within the framework of the evolving needs of Denizli, establishing regular and usable public spaces and a safe and fast transport network throughout the city. (p.59)  <b>Strategy: The quality of public transport</b> services will be improved. (p.61)</p>
İZMİR	<p><b>Strategic objective 1.</b> To provide contemporary <b>and quality</b> service with an approach based on participation and transparency. (p.145)  <b>Strategic Objective 2.1.</b> To create a sustainable city that <b>develops the quality of life</b> by applying systems that are integrate with nature (p.151)  <b>Goal 2.1.3.</b> Improving the slaughterhouses and markets' hygiene and <b>service quality</b> and maintaining food safety (p.151)  <b>Strategic Objective 4.1.</b> Improving infrastructure practices aimed at increasing the <b>quality of urban life</b> (p.163)  <b>Strategic Objective 5.1. Improving the individual travel</b> in terms of its <b>quality</b> with an alternative structure of transportation (p.169)</p>
KÜTAHYA	<p><b>Basic Principles: Quality</b> in services, People-oriented management, Participatory management, realization of citizen-municipality cooperation, working in coordination with other institutions, organizations and non-governmental organizations (p.10)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 02.</b> The Development of Human Resources  <b>Goal 2.1.</b> Realization of training activities to improve the <b>quality</b> of the provided services (p.53)  <b>Strategic Objective 4.3.</b> Decreasing squatter settlement areas and taking measures to prevent the construction of squatter settlements to improve the <b>quality</b> of life of the city (p.68)</p>
MUĞLA	<p><b>Basic principles:</b> To maximize the <b>quality</b> level of our service and to provide the services to our citizens in the fastest way, to adopt an understanding of participatory management in decision-making processes with all dynamics of our city, always be the pioneer in municipal management (p.110)</p> <p><b>Objective:</b> To improve the <b>quality of life</b> of all segments of society. (p.111.)  <b>Strategic Objective. 2.</b> Removing the components that will affect human health and the environment in a negative way and creating a livable city. (p.115)  <b>Goal No. 5.</b> To make public awareness gatherings at least once a year to improve air <b>quality</b>. (p.115)  <b>Strategic Objective.6</b> Carrying the market services to the top ranks of our country in income and service aspects and providing <b>quality</b> products to the consumption of our people. (p.122)</p>
AYDIN	<p><b>Mission:</b> To provide the service that meets the changing world conditions and the common needs of the people living in our city and improves the sustainable life <b>quality</b> with the exemplary municipality understanding. (p.3.)</p> <p><b>Basic values: quality</b> and fast service delivery, people and solution focus, team spirit, governance, motivation, and employee satisfaction. (p.5)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 1:</b> To increase its effectiveness by developing the corporate capacity to realize the mission and achieve the vision with participatory management approach.  <b>Strategic Goal 1.1.</b> To provide fast and <b>quality</b> service to the beneficiaries of the service. (p.94)  <b>Strategic Objective 4.</b> Providing the necessary services to create a healthy, <b>quality</b>, contemporary and safe city. (p.94)  <b>Strategic Objective 5.</b> To increase the contribution of tourism, agriculture, and industry to the city economy in cooperation with institutions and organizations in order to create a brand city in accordance with the cultural and historical texture.  <b>Strategic Goal 5.3.</b> to ensure the access of agricultural products to the public in accordance with the <b>quality</b>, standard and health rules. (p.94)  <b>Strategic Objective 6:</b> Creating livable, sustainable spaces and a healthy environment. (p.95)  <b>Strategy:</b> Increasing the <b>quality standards</b> of our existing squares and parks. (p.103)</p>

MANİSA	<b>Mission:</b> To provide fair, fast and high <b>quality</b> service to improve the quality of life of our citizens with a modern, participatory, transparent and effective governance approach. (p.44)
	<b>Basic values and principles:</b> participation in management, transparency, accountability, sensitivity to citizen demands, understanding of <b>quality</b> in service. (p.45)
	<b>Strengths:</b> The establishment of <b>quality</b> management system (p.40).
UŞAK	<b>Mission:</b> ..... Providing the best and highest <b>quality</b> social municipal services for improving the development trend of Uşak and the quality of life of the people of the city (p.27).
	<b>Goal. 1.2:</b> Establishing a laboratory environment in the oven to increase the <b>quality</b> of hygienic quality bread, to provide each section with increasing the selling points. To obtain ISO-HACCP quality certificate (p.30).
	<b>Strategy. 1.2.3:</b> The laboratory will be established in our bread oven and the <b>quality</b> will be monitored by analyzing the flour and bread. (p.30).
	<b>Strategy.1.2.4:</b> The <b>quality</b> certificates will be obtained with carrying out ISO-HACCP studies at Halk Bread Factory. (p.30)
	<b>Strategy 1.9.5:</b> To be a stable source of income and financing for the Municipality with an exemplary intercity bus terminal operating systematically in a <b>high-quality service</b> and security. (p.33)
	<b>Human Resources Directorate Goal. 1.1.</b> To raise the <b>quality of work</b> and service by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications. (p.69)
<b>Transportation Services Directorate Goal. 1.1:</b> Improving Urban Transportation <b>Quality</b> and Improving Urban Transportation System (p.81)	
<b>Sports Services Directorate Goal. 1. :</b> To provide the opportunity for the people of the city to participate in the sports activities by the understanding of doing sports at any age for a healthy and <b>quality life</b> (p.91)	

At the strategic plans covering the 2014-2019 period, by the Nvivo-Pro 12 program, it has been found out that the municipal administrations' of Aegean Region's provinces used the term quality at their visions, basic principles, their strategic objectives, goals, strategies and performance indicator. In the study, those themes have been demonstrated according to each province's municipal administration.

**Table 3.** The Basic Themes at the Strategic Plans Documents:

<b>The Concepts</b>	<b>The Definitions</b>
<b>Mission, Vision and Basic Values</b>	In the overview of the process of the future, the mission, vision and basic values declarations of the administration are determined. Mission, vision and core values serve as a directivity function for an administration to progress in the long term in line with its ideals. P.30
<b>Strategic Objectives</b>	The objectives are the conceptual expression of the results to be achieved through the implementation of policies regarding the services of the administration. These results are usually related to the solution of socio-economic problems or meeting the needs of citizens and the administration.p.39
<b>Strategic Goals</b>	Goals are the expression of quality and quantity of projected outputs and results for achieving the objectives within a defined time frame.p.40.
<b>Performance Indicators</b>	Performance indicators are used to determine the extent to which the set goals have been achieved. p.45.
<b>Strategies (Activities)</b>	Strategies are a set of decisions that show how to achieve the objectives of the administration. p.48

Source: (The Ministry of Development, 2018)

In the *vision* part of the strategic documents of those related municipal administrations, term quality has been used by Afyon municipality as “service quality”. Moreover, Aydın, Manisa and Uşak municipal administrations also used the quality concept at the formulation of their *missions*. Aydın municipality declared the concept of quality as improving the sustainable life quality of citizens, Manisa and Uşak municipalities used the concept as high-quality service provision. At the examination of the basic principles of the municipal administrations, it has been found that those following concepts which have strong ties with TQM are used at the strategic plans such as;

*“participation, citizens/employee satisfaction, service quality (Afyon), qualified and citizen-oriented service, professional and social development of employees, Participatory, pluralistic management, relations with our internal and external stakeholders on the basis of good governance (Denizli), quality in services, citizen-oriented management, Participatory management, realization of citizen-municipality cooperation, working in coordination with other institutions, organizations and non-governmental organizations (Kütahya), to maximize quality of services, to adopt an understanding of participatory management in decision-making processes.. (Muğla), quality service delivery, people and solution focus, team spirit, governance, motivation and employee satisfaction (Aydın), participation in management, sensitivity to citizen demands, understanding of quality in service (Manisa)”*.

Moreover, Denizli municipal administration demonstrated their strength side with those clarifications, *“the managers and personnel adopted the principle of quality and the municipal administration has a working understanding targeted to raise the quality of urban life, and municipal administration has Quality Management Systems certificates”*. Manisa municipality also indicated their strength as the establishment of quality management system. It is observed that Denizli and Manisa municipal administration also affected from the TQM understanding owing to the fact that the managers and the personnel adopted the quality principle, and owning the certificate on quality management system and establishment of quality management system are highlighted as the strengths of local administrations. The term quality has also been clarified at the strategic objectives, goals, strategies and performance indicator of the municipal administrations as follows;

*“Developing qualified and effective personnel policies to set up a coordinated internal structure (strategic objective/Afyon), to provide contemporary and quality service with an approach based on participation and transparency, to create a sustainable city that improves the quality of life..., improving infrastructure practices aimed at increasing the quality of urban life, improving the quality of individual travel with an alternative transportation structure (strategic objectives /İzmir), providing the necessary services to create a healthy, quality, contemporary and safe city (strategic objective/ Aydın), decreasing squatter settlement areas and taking*



measures to prevent the construction of squatter settlements to improve the quality of life of the city (strategic objective/ Kütahya), to improve the quality of life of all segments of society,... providing quality products to the consumption of our people (strategic objective /Muğla)",

"Providing qualified service and maximizing customer satisfaction (goals/ Afyon), improving the slaughterhouses and markets' hygiene and service quality and maintaining food safety (goal/ İzmir), realization of training activities to improve the quality of the provided services (goal/ Kütahya), to make public awareness gatherings at least once a year to improve air quality (goal/ Muğla), to provide fast and quality service to the beneficiaries of the service, to ensure the access of agricultural products to the public in accordance with the quality, standard and health rules (goal/ Aydın), establishing a laboratory environment in the oven to increase the quality of hygienic quality bread..., to obtain ISO-HACCP quality certificate, to raise the quality of work and service by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications, improving urban transportation quality and improving urban transportation system (goal/ Uşak)",

"the needs of the personnel regarding the physical working environment shall be provided on time, in the desired quantity and quality, the quality of public transport services will be improved (strategies/ Denizli), increasing the quality standards of our existing squares and parks (strategy/ Aydın), the laboratory will be established in our bread oven and the quality will be monitored by analyzing the flour and bread, the quality certificates will be obtained with carrying out ISO-HACCP studies at Halk Bread Factory, to be a stable source of income and financing for the Municipality with an exemplary intercity bus terminal operating systematic in a high-quality service and security (strategy / Uşak), In order to increase the quality level of pesticide works to provide in-service training to related personnel, realizing the 'Art Street' project with the target of developing the quality of life of the inhabitants in a healthy and artistic urban environment...(performance indicator/ Afyon)".

It is observed that most of the expressions have been focused on the quality of service and improving life quality. The targeted public services in raising their quality can be listed as those services such as pesticide, individual travel, and slaughterhouses, markets, air, infrastructure and transportation. Critically, the aim of the provision of qualified services tied to the key principles of TQM as participatory management, employee-training and development with provision of in-service training activities, the realization of training activities, the provision of the needs of the personnel in the desired quality, citizen-orientation with making

public awareness meetings. Some municipal administrations such as Uşak municipality also declared their strategy as obtaining quality certificates.

**Table 4.** The Influence of TQM Approach on the 2010-2014 Period Strategic Plans of Aegean Region's Provinces Municipal Administrations

STRATEGIC PLANS	2010-2014
AFYON	<p><b>Strengths:</b> With the transition of a new automation system in 2004, our business and operations' speed and <b>quality</b> have increased.</p> <p>Providing cheap and <b>quality</b> service through the effective use of alternative service procurement methods in the provision of municipal services.</p> <p>(p.45)</p> <p><b>4.1. Vision:</b> Providing to reach <b>qualified municipal services</b> to our citizens in Afyonkarahisar... (p.55)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 1:</b> Increasing Institutional Capacity And <b>Quality</b></p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 2:</b> Livable Urban Physical Tissue</p> <p><b>Strategic Goal 1.</b> Improving the <b>Quality of Urban Life</b> (p.59)</p>
DENİZLİ	<p><b>Mission:</b> to provide a <b>high quality of life</b> to our citizens with modern urban transformations, strengthened infrastructure, increasing social welfare level and human (first) understanding in a healthy and continuously developing city.</p> <p><b>Basic values:</b> <b>quality in service</b>, participatory pluralist management, transparency, openness and accountability, employee satisfaction and motivation,</p> <p><b>Our quality policy:</b> As Denizli Municipality, we see our employees as the power with the motto of providing <b>high quality of life</b> to our citizens in order to reach our vision under the leadership of senior management, not only to maintain the current situation, but also to define continuous development and improvement as the basic philosophy at every point; to access our citizens with management and solutions based on effectiveness, efficiency, participation, honesty, and transparency; not compromising on the quality of services; to ensure continuous development and improvement in quality, environmental and job security issues. (p.16)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 11:</b> (Culture and Social Affairs Directorate): improve the <b>quality</b> of life of disabled people. (p.67)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 2</b> (Health Affairs Directorate): to provide health care services to our staff with professional managers and leading employees; in the spirit of team, within the framework of modern management understanding, <b>quality</b>, transparent, sincere, understandable and equality principle. (p.80)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 10</b> (Health Affairs Directorate): To maintain the drinking <b>water quality</b> in our city to the most ideal values in accordance with the regulations. (p.83)</p>

İZMİR	<b>Strengths:</b> 6. The Works towards the integrated <b>quality management system</b> have been started. (p.155)
	<b>Strategic objective 1.</b> To provide contemporary and <b>quality service</b> with an approach based on participation and transparency . (p.158)
	<b>Strategic Objective 2.1.</b> Creating a City with a High Environmental <b>Quality of Life</b> . (p.171)
	<b>Strategy Goal 2.1.6.</b> Improving the slaughterhouses and vegetables-fruits and fish markets' <b>quality</b> of hygiene and <b>service</b> . (p.172)
	<b>Strategic Objective 4.1.</b> Carrying Infrastructure Applications to the Top to develop the <b>Quality of Urban Life</b> . (p.196).
	<b>Strategic Objective 5.1. Improving the individual travel</b> in terms of its <b>quality</b> with an alternative structure of transportation. (p.208)
KÜTAHYA	-----
MUĞLA	<p><b>Strategic Objective 7:</b> Developing Health and Veterinary Services,</p> <p><b>Strategy 7.6.3:</b> Performing Certification Activities. (Food Safety Certificate, <b>Quality Certificate</b> and Hygiene Related Documents; ISO 9001, ISO 22000, HACCP).(p.79)</p> <p><b>Strategic Objective 9:</b> Improving <b>Service Quality</b>,</p> <p><b>Goal 9.2</b> Improving the <b>Quality</b> of Construction Services. (p.81)</p>
AYDIN	<b>Strenght.2.4.1.</b> Our <b>quality of drinking water</b> is good. Our drinking water treatment plant is the reference facility of the region. (p.58)
	<b>Mission:</b> To create a green, healthy, livable Aydın by providing friendly, high <b>quality</b> , fair and contemporary services to the people of Aydın. (p.65)
	<b>Basic Principles:</b> effective, efficient and <b>qualified</b> service approach (p.65)
	<b>Strategic Objective 1:</b> Participatory Management: <b>Goal. 1.3.</b> With the aim of the provision of better <b>quality</b> and healthy city life organizing joint activities such as health screening, vocational courses, reading-writing courses with other official institutions, organizations, and associations that will be determined according to the needs. (p.75)
	<b>Strategic Objective 8. Transportation and Traffic</b> <b>Goal.8.1.</b> To carry out the necessary activities to increase the <b>quality</b> of all transportation systems in our province. (p.133)
MANİSA	-----
UŞAK	<b>Service policies of municipal administration: Qualified</b> service and citizen satisfaction.(p.39)

<p><b>Strategic Objective 1:</b> By bringing the administrative structure of the municipality and its personnel into conformity with the norm cadre principles, to educate trained, experienced, qualified and competent personnel, to assign the trained personnel in the units appropriate to their qualifications and to maximize service efficiency, <b>to pass the total quality management</b>, to prepare working instructions of units and the municipal organization regulation. (p.58-59)</p> <p><b>Goal 1.2:</b> To raise the <b>quality</b> of work and service by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications.(p.59)</p> <p><b>Strategy 1.2.2:</b> For improving the <b>quality</b> of work and services of the municipal staff, at least three times a year, internal-external, domestic- international, computer, operator, fire training, civil defense, search and rescue, first aid, foreign language, etc. courses will be organized and the participation of the personnel according to their administrative, technical status and position will be ensured.(p.59)</p>
-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

At the strategic plans covering the 2010-2014 period, by the Nvivo-Pro 12 program, it has been found out that the municipal administrations' of Aegean Region's provinces used the term quality at their visions, missions, strengths, their strategic objectives, goals, and strategies. Those themes have been demonstrated according to each province's municipal administration. At the *vision and mission* parts of the strategic documents of those related municipal administrations, term quality has been used as service quality and life quality. Afyon municipality used the concept quality at their vision as the provision of qualified services and Aydın municipality used the concept at their mission as the provision of high quality services, and Denizli municipality at their mission used the concept as the provision of high quality of life to citizens.

At the strategic plans of Afyon and Aydın municipalities, the provision of qualified service has been emphasized which is a critical issue at the TQM process. At the examination of the basic principles of the municipal administrations, it has found out that those following concepts having strong ties with TQM are used such as;

“quality in service, participatory pluralist management, employee satisfaction and motivation (Denizli), effective, efficient and qualified service approach (Aydın), qualified service and citizen satisfaction (Uşak).”

Significantly, Denizli municipality has quality policy is critical at the reflection of TQM understanding to the local level, as declaring that “*Denizli Municipality, we see our employees as the power with the motto of providing high quality of life to our citizens in order to reach*

*our vision under the leadership of senior management, not only to maintain the current situation, but also to define continuous development and improvement as the basic philosophy at every point; to access our citizens with management and solutions based on effectiveness, efficiency, participation, honesty, and transparency; not compromising on the quality of services; to ensure continuous development and improvement in quality, environmental and job security issues”.*

It is seen that the key principles of participatory management and continuous development and improvement of TQM are used at the quality policy of Denizli municipal administration. Moreover, some of the municipal administrations such as Afyon, İzmir and Aydın, the term of quality has also been used at the strengths part of the strategic plans with those clarifications such as;

“With the transition of a new automation system in 2004, our business and operations’ speed and quality have increased, providing cheap and quality service through the effective use of alternative service procurement methods in the provision of municipal services (Afyon municipality), the works towards the integrated quality management system have been started.. (İzmir municipality), our quality of drinking water is good (Aydın municipality)”.

Qualified service provision is illustrated as strength and also critically, quality management system starting is a significant step at the TQM process. The term quality has also been clarified at the strategic objectives, goals and strategies as follows;

“increasing institutional capacity and quality (strategic objective/ Afyon), to provide contemporary and **quality service** with an approach based on participation and transparency, creating a city with a high environmental quality of life, carrying infrastructure applications to the top to improve the quality of urban life, improving the quality of individual travel..(strategic objectives/ İzmir), improving service quality (strategic objective/ Muğla), .. to pass the total quality management, to prepare working instructions of units and the municipal organization regulation (strategic objective/ Uşak), improve the quality of life of disabled people, to provide health care services to our staff with professional managers and leading employees; in the spirit of team, within the framework of modern management understanding, quality, transparent, sincere, understandable and equality principle, to maintain the drinking water quality in our city to the most ideal values in accordance with the regulations (strategic objectives/ Denizli”.

“improving the quality of urban life (goal/ Afyon), improving the hygiene and service quality of slaughterhouses and vegetables-fruits and fish markets (goal/İzmir), improving the

quality of construction services (goal/ Muğla), with the aim of the provision of a better quality and healthy city life organizing joint activities..., to carry out the necessary activities to increase the quality of all transportation systems in our province (goal/ Aydın), to raise the quality of work and service by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications (goal/Uşak)”,

“performing certification activities (food safety certificate, quality certificate and hygiene related documents; ISO 9001, ISO 22000, HACCP) (strategy/ Muğla), For improving the quality of work and services of the municipal staff, at least three times a year, internal-external, domestic- international, computer, operator, fire training, civil defense, search and rescue, first aid, foreign language, etc. courses will be organized and the participation of the personnel according to their administrative, technical status and position will be ensured (strategy/ Uşak)”,

It is observed that at the strategic plans, the municipal administrations focused on improving the quality of services and providing high quality of life to the citizens. The targeted public services in raising their quality can be listed as those services such as individual travel, water, transportation, slaughterhouses and vegetables-fruits and fish markets, and construction. Critically, the provision of qualified services tied to the key principles of TQM as participatory management with organizing joint activities such as health screening, vocational courses, reading-writing courses with other official institutions, organizations and associations; employee training and development by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications; and to provide health services to staff with professional managers and leading employees. One of the most important outcomes of the study is the Uşak Municipality’s usage of the term TQM at its strategic objective concerning its intention to pass that TQM approach. Besides, Denizli municipality’s quality policy is also a critical finding with its link with TQM principles as continuous development and improvement and participatory management. Lastly, Muğla municipality also determined their strategy as performing certification activities such as Quality Certificate is also critical for TQM.

As a general evaluation, it is seen that TQM management and its key principles have been located at the vision, mission, strategic objectives, goals, strategies and performance indicator of Aegean Region’s provincial administrations and some of the municipalities also declared objective as passing to TQM and almost all municipal administrations’ have the target to provide qualified services and improving life quality. In the 2010-2019 period, the targeted



public services in raising their quality can be listed as those services such as pesticide, individual travel and slaughterhouses, markets, air, infrastructure and transportation, water and construction. In the study, it has been found out that in the 2010-2019 period the provision of qualified services tied to the key principles of TQM as participatory management with organizing joint activities such as health screening, vocational courses, reading-writing courses with other official institutions, organizations and associations; employee training and development by educating trained, experienced and expert personnel and by assigning trained personnel in accordance with their qualifications and with provision of in-service training activities, realization of training activities, the provision of the needs of the personnel in the desired quality, and to provide health services to staff with professional managers and leading employees; and citizen-orientation with making public awareness meetings. In the study, it has found out that TQM process affects those related municipal administrations in the period covering the 2010-2019 period.

## **5. CONCLUSION AND PROPOSALS**

From the strategic plans of the Aegean provinces' municipal administrations, most of the municipal administration used the concept of quality in their visions, missions, basic values and principles, strategic objectives, goals, strategies and performance indicator. Moreover, some municipal administrations such as Denizli municipal administration (2010-2014 strategic plan period) declared their quality policy which comprises the key principles of TQM as continuous development and improvement, participatory management, and also Uşak municipality (2010-2014 strategic plan period) also determined their strategic objective as passing to the TQM. It is critical that after the examination of the strategic plans of those municipalities, it is seen that most of the municipality declared their basic principles and values with the key principles of TQM (especially at the 2014-2019 strategic plan period) as follows;

“participation, citizens/employee satisfaction, service quality (Afyon), qualified and citizen-oriented service, professional and social development of employees, Participatory, pluralistic management, relations with our internal and external stakeholders on the basis of good governance (Denizli), quality in services, oriented management, Participatory management, realization of citizen-municipality cooperation, working in coordination with other institutions, organizations and non-governmental organizations (Kütahya), to maximize quality of services, to adopt an understanding of participatory management in decision-making processes (Muğla), quality service delivery, people and solution focus, team spirit, governance,

motivation and employee satisfaction (Aydın), participation in management, sensitivity to citizen demands, understanding of quality in service (Manisa)''.

In that regard, the success of TQM practices are also tied to some key points which are listed as; adopting the TQM philosophy by local administrators, enabling required financial resources of local governments, the provision of the openness in all kinds of administrative activities of local governments (Öztürk and Coşkun, 1998: 123-124). In order to do a general evaluation and make proposals concerning TQM implementation at municipal administrations in Turkey, the main problem areas should be taken into account. In this context, the top managers at the municipal administration should give the required attention towards that new understanding and its application. The municipal administration should reach to the required financial amount at the application of TQM practices. The local regulations and provisions should be in harmony with TQM understanding and its key principles for the success of TQM applications at the municipal administrations. The municipal administration should set up collaboration and coordination in the TQM process. The municipal administration should set up a communication mechanism to learn the needs, demands, and complaints of the employees and local citizens. The required in-service training activities should be organized for the mayor, the municipal councilors and the employees. The municipal administration should determine its current strengths and weaknesses at the implementation process, and designate its policies in accordance with the TQM practices.

## REFERENCES

Acar, Ali and Sevinç, İsmail (2013). “Toplam Kalite Yönetiminin Kamu Sektörüne Uygulanmasında Karşılaşılan Sorunlar”, *Selçuk Üniversitesi İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Fakültesi, Sosyal ve Ekonomik Araştırmalar Dergisi*, Yıl: 13 / Sayı: 25, pp:1-16.

Afyon Municipality, (2010-2014) Strategic Plan, <<https://www.afyon.bel.tr/upload/tr/dosya/dokumanyonetimi/1/01102010111132-1.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Afyon Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <<https://www.afyon.bel.tr/upload/tr/dosya/dokumanyonetimi/336/17122014082008-1.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Arık, K. Fikret and Kenan Sürgit, “Merkezi Hükümet Teşkilatı Araştırma Projesi (MEHTAP)”, Yedinci İskan ve Şehircilik Haftası Konferansları, 11-13 Haziran 1963, Ankara, İskan ve Şehircilik Derneği Yayınları No: 2, Ankara-1964, p. 92.

Arıkboğa, Ülkü, (2016). *Belediyelerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi*, Ankara: Orion Kitabevi.

Aydın Metropolitan Municipality, (2010-2014) Strategic Plan, <<http://aydin.bel.tr/Content/files/2009-2014-stratejik-plan.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Aydın Metropolitan Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <[http://aydin.bel.tr/Content/files/2015-2019\\_stratej%C4%B1k\\_plan.pdf](http://aydin.bel.tr/Content/files/2015-2019_stratej%C4%B1k_plan.pdf)>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Balcı, Asım, (2005). “Kamu Örgütlerinde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Uygulanması: Olumlu Perspektifler ve Olası Zorluklar”, *Selçuk Üniversitesi Karaman İktisadi ve İdari Bilimler Dergisi*, Sayı:2, Cilt:5, pp.196-211.

Coşkun, Bayram, (2005). “Türkiye’de Kamu Yönetiminde Yeniden Yapılanma Tarihsel Geçmiş Ve Genel Bir Değerlendirme”, *Türk İdare Dergisi*, Sayı: 448, Eylül Sayısı, Ankara, pp.13-47.

Dahlgaard, Jens, Kristensen, Kai and Kanji, Gopthal, (2007). “Fundamentals of Total Quality Mangement”, *Taylor-Francis e-Library*, London and New York.

Denizli Metropolitan Municipality, (2010-2014) Strategic Plan, <<http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSPStratejikPlan/files/eqzB2+DenizliBelediyesiSP1014.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Denizli Metropolitan Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <[https://www2.denizli.bel.tr/userfiles/file/stratejik\\_plan\\_2015-2019.pdf](https://www2.denizli.bel.tr/userfiles/file/stratejik_plan_2015-2019.pdf)>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Ersoy S., Mesiha and Ersoy, Abdullah, (2011). *Kalite Yönetimi: Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Kalite Denetimi*, Ankara: İmaj Yayınevi.

İzmir Metropolitan Municipality, (2010-2017) Strategic Plan, <[https://www.izmir.bel.tr/CKYuklenen/eskisite/file/23\\_12\\_2013%2016\\_30\\_30\\_2010-2017straplanMyeni.pdf](https://www.izmir.bel.tr/CKYuklenen/eskisite/file/23_12_2013%2016_30_30_2010-2017straplanMyeni.pdf)>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

İzmir Metropolitan Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <[https://www.izmir.bel.tr/CKYuklenen/eskisine/file/MALI\\_HIZMETLER/2015\\_19StratejikPlan\\_web.pdf](https://www.izmir.bel.tr/CKYuklenen/eskisine/file/MALI_HIZMETLER/2015_19StratejikPlan_web.pdf)>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Kaya, Erol, (2012). *Belediyelerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve ISO 9000*, <[www.erolkaya.com/wp-content/uploads/btky.pdf](http://www.erolkaya.com/wp-content/uploads/btky.pdf)>. (Accessed in 15.10.2019).

Keleş, Ruşen, (2012). *Yerinden Yönetim ve Siyaset*. Genişletilmiş 5. Basım, Cem Yayınevi: İstanbul.

Kütahya Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <[http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSPStratejikPlan/files/VXCzY+kutahya\\_beleدية\\_stratejik\\_plan\\_2015-19.pdf](http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSPStratejikPlan/files/VXCzY+kutahya_beleدية_stratejik_plan_2015-19.pdf)>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Leblebici, Doğan Nabi, Ömürgönülşen, Uğur and Aydın, Mehmet Devrim, (2001). “Yeni Kamu İşletmeciliği Yaklaşımında Önemli Bir Araç: Toplam Kalite Yönetimi”, *Hacettepe Üniversitesi İ.İ.B.F. Dergisi*, Cilt. 19, Sayı. 1, pp.123-135.

Manisa Metropolitan Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <<http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSPStratejikPlan/files/Xo85g+stratejik.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Mengi, Ayşegül, (1997). “Kamu Yönetiminde Gelişmeler, Yerel Yönetimler ve Türkiye”, *Ankara Üniversitesi Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Dergisi*, Sayı 1-4, Cilt:52, pp.505-515.

Muğla Municipality, (2010-2014) Strategic Plan, <<http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSPStratejikPlan/files/MEuZs+MuglaBelediyesiSP1014.pdf>> (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Muğla Metropolitan Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <[https://www.mugla.bel.tr/uploads/sayfatr/2015\\_2019\\_stratejik\\_plan.pdf](https://www.mugla.bel.tr/uploads/sayfatr/2015_2019_stratejik_plan.pdf)> (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Nohutçu, Ahmet, (2005). ‘Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Yerel Yönetimler’, *Kamu Yönetiminde ve Kamu Hizmetlerinde Kalite*, Coşkun Can Aktan & Ulvi Saran (eds.), Mayıs 2005, Ankara: Hizmet-İş Sendikası Yayın, Yayın No:36, pp. 91-113.

Özeroğlu, Ali İhsan, (2015), “Yerel Yönetimlerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi”, *Tarih Okulu Dergisi*, Yıl:8, Sayı: 21, pp. 539-581.

Özgül, Mustafa, (2014). *Yerel Yönetimlerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Uygulamalarının Etkilerinin Analizi* (Dikmen Belediyesi), KKTC, Uluslararası Kıbrıs Üniversitesi, Lisansüstü Eğitim-Öğretim ve Araştırma Enstitüsü, İşletme Yönetimi Anabilim Dalı, Yayınlanmamış Yüksek Lisans Tezi.

Özşen, Tayfur. “(1998). Toplam Yönetim Kalitesi”, *Türk İdare Dergisi*, Yıl. 70, Sayı. 421, pp.283-296.

Öztemel, Ercan, (2001). *Belediyelerde Toplam Kalite Yönetimi*, Değişim Yayınları: Adapazarı.

Öztürk, Namık Kemal and Coşkun, Bayram, (1998). “Yerel Yönetimlerde Toplam Kalite Yönetiminin Uygulanması ve Ortaya Çıkan Sorunlar, *Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler Dergisi*, Cilt.7, Sayı, 4, pp.113-125.

Peker, Ömer, (1996a). “Belediye Yönetimlerinde Kalite Üretimi”, *Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler*, C.5, S.2, Mart-1996, pp.15-23.

Peker, Ömer (1996b). “Toplam Kalite Yönetimi ve Kamu Hizmetlerinde Kalite”, *Çağdaş Yerel Yönetimler*, Cilt. 5, Sayı. 6, pp.43-57.

Samson, Danny and Terziovski, Mile, (1999). “The Relationship Between Total Quality Management Practices and Operational Performance”, *Journal of Operations Management*, Vol.17, Issue.4., pp. 393-409.

Saran, M. Ulvi and Göçerler, Ahmet, (1998). “Kamu Hizmetlerinde ve İçişleri Bakanlığı’nda Toplam Kalite Yönetimi”, *Türk İdare Dergisi*, Yıl: 70, Sayı: 421, pp. 225-282.

Soysal, Abdullah and Alıcı, Sedat, (2006). “Yerel Yönetimlerde Kaliteli Hizmet Anlayışının Geliştirilmesi ve Kurumsallaştırılması”, *Türk İdare Dergisi*, Sayı: 450, pp.167-182.

State Planning Organization (DPT), 8. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı (2001-2005), <[http://www.bilgitoplumu.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/Sekizinci Kalkınma Planı.pdf](http://www.bilgitoplumu.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2015/01/Sekizinci_Kalkinma_Planı.pdf)>, <[http://www3.kalkinma.gov.tr/Portal Design/Portal Controls/](http://www3.kalkinma.gov.tr/PortalDesign/PortalControls/)> (Accessed in 10.11.2019).

State Planning Organization (DPT), 9. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı, (2007-2013). <<https://www.metu.edu.tr/system/files/kalkinma.pdf>> (Accessed in 10.11.2019).

Suğur, Nadir, Nichols, Theo and Suğur, Serap, (2004). “Türkiye’de Toplam Kalite Yönetimi Uygulamaları: Beyaz Eşya, Otomotiv ve Tekstil Sektörü Üzerine Bir Araştırma?”, *Ankara Üniversitesi, Siyasal Bilgiler Fakültesi Dergisi*, Cilt.59, No.2, pp:127-150.

The Law No 5018, (2003), Kamu Malî Yönetimi Ve Kontrol Kanunu, The Date of Acceptance 10/12/2003, Published Official Gazette 24/12/2003, No: 25326, <<https://www.mevzuat.gov.tr/MevzuatMetin/1.5.5018.pdf>> (Accessed in 10.11.2019).

The Ministry of Development, (2014-2018), 10. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı, <<http://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2018/11/Onuncu-Kalk%C4%B1nma-Plan%C4%B1-2014-2018.pdf>>, (Accessed in 12.11.2019).

The Ministry of Development, (2018), “Kamu İdareleri İçin Stratejik Planlama Kılavuzu” , 3. Sürüm, <<http://www.sp.gov.tr/upload/xSpKutuphane/files/VrllQ+Kamu Idareleri Icin Stratejik Planlama Kılavuzu.pdf>> (Accessed in 12.11.2019).

The Republic of Turkey Presidency, Strategy And Budget Headship, (2019-2023), 11. Beş Yıllık Kalkınma Planı, <<http://www.sbb.gov.tr/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/OnbirinciKalkinmaPlanı.pdf>> (Accessed in 12.11.2019).

Uşak Municipality, (2015-2019) Strategic Plan, <<https://www.usak.bel.tr/dosya/files/stratejikplan/2015-2019stratejikplan.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Uşak Municipality, (2010-2014) Strategic Plan, <<https://www.usak.bel.tr/dosya/files/stratejikplan/2009-2014stratejikplan.pdf>>. (Accessed in 14.11.2019).

Yatkın, Ahmet, (2004). *Toplam Kalite Yönetimi*, Nobel Yayın: Ankara.